

# Lesson 3: Refutation of Giufà and the Judge

## The Narrative

Read the narrative, noting the Narrative Components.

One day Giufà went out to gather herbs, and it was night before he returned. On his way back, the moon rose through the clouds, and Giufà sat down on a stone and watched the moon appear and disappear behind the clouds, and he exclaimed constantly, "It appears, it appears! It sets, it sets!"

Now there were near the way some thieves who were skinning a calf which they had stolen, and when they heard "It appears, it sets!" they feared that the officers of justice were coming, so they ran away and left the meat.

When Giufà saw the thieves running away, he went to see what it was and found the calf skinned. He took his knife and cut off flesh enough to fill his sack and went home. When he arrived there, his mother asked him why he came so late. He said it was because he was bringing some meat which she was to sell the next day, and the money was to be kept for him. The next day his mother sent him into the country and sold the meat.

In the evening Giufà returned and asked his mother, "Did you sell the meat?"

"Yes, I sold it to the flies on credit."

"When will they give you the money?"

"When they get it."

A week passed, and the flies brought no money, so Giufà went to the judge and said to him, "Sir, I want justice. I sold the flies meat on credit, and they have not come to pay me."

The judge said, "I pronounce this sentence on them: Wherever you see them, you may kill them."

Just then a fly lighted on the judge's nose, and Giufà dealt it such a blow that he broke the judge's head.

## 1. Discredit

This paragraph begins the refutation by discrediting the author or the story.

### 1. Introduction

Write a general statement of discredit about the author or the story.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 2. Discredits

Write at least three discredits about the story or the author.

**Write your answer** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 3. Thesis

Write a sentence that tells what this essay is about. Include the name of the story.

**Write your answer** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## Rough Draft

Combine the three elements above into a paragraph. Add Anemographia.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## 2. Exposition

This paragraph retells the story being refuted.

### 1. Narrative

Identify the Narrative Components and then form them into a narrative.

1. Recognition: \_\_\_\_\_
2. Reversal: \_\_\_\_\_
3. Suffering: \_\_\_\_\_
4. Agents: \_\_\_\_\_
5. Action: \_\_\_\_\_
6. Time: \_\_\_\_\_
7. Place: \_\_\_\_\_
8. Manner: \_\_\_\_\_
9. Cause: \_\_\_\_\_

Write your answer: \_\_\_\_\_

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## 2. Transition

Write a transition sentence.

Write your answer: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## Rough Draft

Retell the narrative to your audience using the Narrative Components, and then add the Transition. Add Astrothesia.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## 3. Unclarity

This paragraph shows how an action in the story is unclear. To be “unclear” means the cause could not produce the effect.

One day Giufà went out to gather herbs, and it was night before he returned. On his way back, the moon rose through the clouds, and Giufà sat down on a stone and watched the moon appear and disappear behind the clouds, and he exclaimed constantly, “It appears, it appears! It sets, it sets!”

### 1. Rhetorical Question

State the fact you will be disputing, then ask a rhetorical question that casts doubt on the fact.

Write your answer: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 2. Statement

Tell why the fact you are disputing is unclear.

Write your answer: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 3. Counter Argument

Quote an opponent's possible counter argument.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 4. Answer Counter Argument

Give an answer to the counter argument.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 5. Answer Counter Argument

Give a second answer to the counter argument.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 6. Dilemma

In the form of an either/or sentence, state a dilemma based on your previous points.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add Onomatopoeia.

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## 4. Implausibility

This paragraph shows how an action in the story is unlikely to have occurred.

Now there were near the way some thieves who were skinning a calf which they had stolen, and when they heard "It appears, it sets!" they feared that the officers of justice were coming, so they ran away and left the meat.

### 1. Transition

Ask readers to grant the previous point, and then ask a rhetorical question that casts doubt on the fact you will be disputing.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 2. Statement

Paraphrase your previous concession and state the implausibility.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 3. Rhetorical Question

Paraphrase #2 with a rhetorical question that casts doubt on the implausible action.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 4. Counter Argument

Quote an opponent's possible counter argument.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 5. Answer Counter Argument

Answer the counter argument in the form of a rhetorical question.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 6. Dilemma

In the form of an either/or sentence, state a dilemma based on your previous points.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## 7. Counter Argument

Quote a second possible counter argument from an opponent.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## 8. Dilemma

Answer the counter argument with an either/or sentence.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## 9. Statement

Write a paraphrase of your general argument.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add Anemographia.

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

# 5. Impossibility

This paragraph shows how an action in the story is impossible.

When Giufà saw the thieves running away, he went to see what it was and found the calf skinned. He took his knife and cut off flesh enough to fill his sack and went home. When he arrived there, his mother asked him why he came so late. He said it was because he was bringing some meat which she was to sell the next day, and the money was to be kept for him. The next day his mother sent him into the country and sold the meat.

## 1. Transition

Ask readers to grant the previous point.

Write your answer: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## 2. Rhetorical Question

Ask a rhetorical question that casts doubt on a particular fact from the story and shows a logical contradiction.

Write your answer: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## 3. Statement

Answer the rhetorical question with a general statement that is a paraphrase of #2.

Write your answer: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## 4. Rhetorical Question

In the form of "If ... then ..." ask a general rhetorical question that is a loose paraphrase of #3.

Write your answer: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## 5. Statement

Flatly contradict #2-4 with particulars from the story to show that it is impossible.

Write your answer: \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## Sylogism (#6-9 are optional if you have not studied Logic)

Create a sylogism using one of the nouns you used in #2. Use the sylogism to complete #6-9.

**major premise:** \_\_\_\_\_

**minor premise:** \_\_\_\_\_

**conclusion:** \_\_\_\_\_

### 6. Rhetorical Question

Ask a rhetorical question that includes the conclusion of your sylogism.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_

---

---

### 7. Statement

State the major or minor premise.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_

---

---

### 8. Rhetorical Question

Paraphrase the conclusion as a rhetorical question.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_

---

---

### 9. Rhetorical Question

Ask a rhetorical question that condemns the author and paraphrases the conclusion of the sylogism.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_

---

---

### Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add Onomatopoeia.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---



## 6. Inconsistency

This paragraph shows how a person in the story acts inconsistently, or unjustly.

In the evening Giufà returned and asked his mother, "Did you sell the meat?"

"Yes, I sold it to the flies on credit."

"When will they give you the money?"

"When they get it."

### 1. Rhetorical Question

In the form of "Why ..." ask a rhetorical question that points to a particular inconsistent action in the story.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 2. Rhetorical Question

Ask a rhetorical question in the form of "If ... then ..." that expounds on #1.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 3. Rhetorical Question

State a general truth, and then ask a rhetorical question that points out an inconsistency with this truth in the story.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 4. Dilemma

In the form of an either/or sentence, state a dilemma based on your previous points.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add Onomatopoeia.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## 7. Impropriety

This paragraph shows how a person in the story lacks moral integrity or honor.

A week passed, and the flies brought no money, so Giufà went to the judge and said to him, "Sir, I want justice. I sold the flies meat on credit, and they have not come to pay me."

The judge said, "I pronounce this sentence on them: Wherever you see them, you may kill them."

### 1. Rhetorical Question

In the form of "Why ..." ask a rhetorical question that points to a particular improper action in the story.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 2. Rhetorical Question

State a general truth, and then ask a rhetorical question in the form of "If ... then ..." that points out an impropriety in the character in the story.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 3. Statement

Paraphrase #2 in an "If ... then ..." statement, but reverse the order and begin with "then."

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add Aequipollentia.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## 8. Inexpediency

This paragraph shows how a person's action in the story was not helpful or useful.

Just then a fly lighted on the judge's nose, and Giufà dealt it such a blow that he broke the judge's head.

### 1. Rhetorical Question

In the form of "Why ..." ask a rhetorical question that points to a particular inexpedient action in the story.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 2. Statement

State a general truth that relates to #1.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

### 3. Rhetorical Question

In the form of "How then ..." ask a rhetorical question that expands on the question in #1.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

#### 4. Exclamation

Express disbelief that someone would act so inexpediently.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

#### 5. Dilemma

In the form of an either/or sentence, state a dilemma based on your previous points.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

#### Rough Draft

Combine the sentences. Add Enallage.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## 9. Epilogue

This paragraph concludes the essay.

#### Epilogue

Conclude briefly by restating the discredit and challenging the audience.

**Write your answer:** \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## Final Draft

Proofread the rough drafts above, and correct errors in grammar, spelling, and punctuation.  
On a separate sheet of paper, combine the corrected rough drafts into the form of a final draft.